
Federico Varese
Department of Sociology
University of Oxford
federico.varese@sociology.ox.ac.uk

References


Outline of the Talk

• Definitions and Theory
• Research Design and Cases
• Discussion of the ‘Ndrangheta in Northern Italy and the Russian Mafia in Rome
• Conclusions (based on all cases)

Ex. ‘Ndrangheta, Cosa Nostra, Italian American Mafia, Hong Kong Triads, Solinevo and other Russian gruppirovki, Yakuza

-TWO VIEWS ON MAFIAS’ TRANSPPLANTATION:

GAMBETTA, REUTER VS SHELLEY/ WILLIAMS/ CASTELS
### Factors Conducive to Mafia Transplantation

#### Supply/1 Intentional Decision to Move

- **Resource Acquisition**: the group opens an outpost to search for input factors
- **Economic Investment**: to search for opportunities to re-invest/launder its gains
- **Protection Activities**: to colonize new markets, such as new protection rackets

#### Supply/2 Un-Intentional Decision to Move

- **Generalized Migration**
- **Soggiorno Obbligato**
- **Mafia Wars**
- **Police Repression**
## LOCAL CONDITIONS

- Trust/social capital
- Newly Formed Market Economies
- Booming markets and incentives to create cartels
- Large illegal markets
- Size of the Locale
- Presence of Existing OC/Mafia Groups

## Factors that facilitate Transplantation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOCAL CONDITIONS</th>
<th>Supply of Mafiosi</th>
<th>Trust/social capital</th>
<th>Presence of local protectors</th>
<th>Size of the territory</th>
<th>New or Expanding Markets *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEMAND for mafia services</td>
<td>YES/NO</td>
<td>Generalized Migration</td>
<td>Migration of Mafiosi (intentional/non-intentional)</td>
<td>Trust/social capital</td>
<td>Presence of local protectors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(*) Markets: Constructions (Bardonecchia and Rosario), Drugs (Verona and China), Property Rights (Budapest, China), Gas (Budapest), Alcohol (NYC), Gambling (NYC and China), Prostitution (China).
From Calabria to Bardonecchia (Piedmont) and Verona (Veneto)
Data (for all cases)

- Data on migration by territory of origin
- Data on specific markets (e.g. Construction)
- Police Reports
  -- Judicial Evidence, Extensive Phone Intercepts
- Field Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Percentage of residents born within the region</th>
<th>Percentage of residents born outside the region</th>
<th>Percentage of residents born in Sicily, Campania and Calabria</th>
<th>Percentage of residents born in Calabria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1951:</td>
<td>Turin</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milan</td>
<td>79.3</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rome</td>
<td>67.0</td>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verona</td>
<td>93.2</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961:</td>
<td>Turin</td>
<td>68.7</td>
<td>28.8</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milan</td>
<td>72.0</td>
<td>26.1</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rome</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>33.2</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verona</td>
<td>91.1</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971:</td>
<td>Turin</td>
<td>60.8</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milan</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>31.8</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rome</td>
<td>64.1</td>
<td>33.0</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verona</td>
<td>89.9</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981:</td>
<td>Turin</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>34.1</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milan</td>
<td>68.1</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rome</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verona</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Individuals sentenced to *soggiorno obbligato* in the four Provinces of Piedmont 1961–72

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>No of individuals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Torino</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuneo</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asti</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alessandria</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Piedmont</strong></td>
<td><strong>288</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[11.19% Italian Total]

Rocco Lo Presti
Number of licenses to build new home complexes, City of Bardonecchia, 1950–2000

Note: The graph shows the average number for each five-year period.
Source: Data collected in Ufficio Licenze Edilizie, Comune di Bardonecchia.

Percentages of licenses obtained by the biggest four construction companies, Bardonecchia, 1950–1979

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Firm</th>
<th>5 year period</th>
<th>1950–54</th>
<th>55–59</th>
<th>60–64</th>
<th>65–69</th>
<th>70–74</th>
<th>75–79</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gibello</td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carisio &amp; Pesando</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patané &amp; Raitieri</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zedda A. &amp; I.</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>18.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data collected in Ufficio Licenze Edilizie, Comune di Bardonecchia.
An associate told [Yakovlev]: “Here (in Italy) you can do whatever you want, it is not Europe” (SCO 1997a:190).

The Data

- Three-volume report
- 250 people mentioned
- 45 files on specific individuals
- 758 conversations recorded in the period January-October 1996
- 164 individuals in phone conversation with each other
Data Sets Created

- **data set of conversations** (n=758; 23 variables, e.g. date/time of conversation; who calls whom; no of words; country calling/receiving, with/out interpreter, etc.). Full set of conversations from January 1996 to October 1996 only.

- **data set of individuals** (n=164; 20 variables, e.g. name, gender, criminal records, entry in Italy, nationality, place of residence, language skills, etc.)

Data Sets Created (cnt.)

Network matrices:

- **Global Network of 164**. Datum in the cell: # of times two actors call each other

- **Directed Network**. 138 actors with direction (who calls whom)

- **Longitudinal Directed Network**. 138 actors with direction, at three points in time, I-III/96; IV-VI/96; VII-IX/96)

- **Attribute file** (gender, language(s) spoken, nationality, tasks)
Techniques used

• Quantitative Content Analysis

  1. Homals, HOMOGENEITY analysis (type of Multiple Correspondence Analysis/Multi-dimensional Scaling): It portrays the “correspondence” of categories of variables, particularly those measured in nominal measurement scales. This correspondence is then the basis for developing perceptual maps. The unique benefits of CA lie in its abilities for representing rows and columns, for example, brands and attributes, in joint space.

• Actor-oriented Models for Network Evolution (Snijders 2001)
Basic Demographics

• **Gender**: 70% M (N=115)
• **Nationality**: Italian (30%, N=50); born in the former Soviet Union (62%, N=107); Polish (n=2) and Korean (n=2). Three unknown
• **Place of Residence** (N=161): Rome (47.6%) or Moscow (20.5%).
• **Age**: The median year of birth 1957 (39 years old in 1996).

Tasks Defined

- Read all conversations (many times!)
- Identified a ‘topic of conversation’ for each conversation
- 69 topics devoted to four Tasks:
  - Economic Investments
  - Resource Acquisition
  - Protection Activity
  - Group Management***

- How many conversations refer to which task:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Investments (EI)</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>51.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Management (GM)</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>22.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource Acquisition (RA)</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection Activities (PA)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>758</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Correspondence Analysis of Actor and Main Task**
Correspondence Analysis - Actors/Main Tasks

\[ sp = OA \times OB \times \cos(\alpha) \]

\[ sp = OC \times OD \times \cos(\beta) \]
Correspondence analysis of Gender, Nationality, Residence, Language Spoken and Main Task

[Graph showing correspondence analysis with categories like Gender, Nationality, Residence, Language, and Main Task represented with symbols and coordinates.]
Tasks discussed in conversations, January–October 1996

The Russian Mafia Network in Rome
• Factions within the Russian-Italian Mafia network. Size of node, normalized degree centrality expressed as a percentage; shape, faction.

• Factions within the 16 actors under surveillance. Data extracted from SCO (1997). Size of node, normalized degree centrality expressed as a percentage; shape, nationality; colour, faction. Thickness of the line is a function of the number of times actors call each other. The thicker the line, the greater the number of times two actors call each other.
Conclusions/1

- Based on the in-depth study of eight cases of OC mobility (Varese 2011):
  - ‘Ndrangheta from Calabria to Piedmont and Veneto (Northern Italy);
  - the Sicilian mafia to New York City and Rosario, Argentina;
  - the Russian mafia to Rome and Hungary;
  - Hong King and Taiwanese triads to mainland China.

Conclusions/2

- In the new territories Mafias do different things:
  Control Markets and Territory in Bardonecchia, Hungary, US; Money Laundering in Rome

- Concept of Transnational Organized Crime is too vague/useless
Conclusions/3

-Migration on its own it is not a cause of transplantation

-Mafiosi find themselves in new territories as an (unintended) consequence of policing in the territory of origin or Mafia infighting

-The presence of existing protectors hinders transplantation

-‘Supply’ on its own does not cause transplantation

Conclusions/4

-High level of trust in the new territory is not enough to prevent transplantation (*contra* Putnam)

-The inability of the State to govern major transformation in the economy can lead to transplantation

-*Ceteris paribus*, smaller locales are easier to penetrate

-Incentives to create local cartels (as opposed to an export-oriented economy) are conducive to transplantation
**Policy recommendations/1**

- **Booming markets** must be monitored in order to avoid market incumbents turning to OC to reduce competition or form illegal cartels. Local markets such as construction are more open to this kind of OC intervention. Global competition ultimately reduces this form of OC intervention.

- A **large workforce** that operates outside the framework of the law gives rise to opportunities for forming extra-legal forms of governance. Such situations should not be allowed to emerge. Rather, the workforce should be integrated in the legal economy.

**Policy recommendations/2**

- Everything else being equal, it is easier for incoming OC criminals to control small towns than large cities. When state or federal authorities devolve power to local communities they must be aware that small groups can seize these opportunities.

- Administrative **office rotation** to minimize the formation of long-term ties between incumbents and OC.

- Law enforcement should to monitor what takes place in other countries. Through targeted intelligence, law enforcement should **monitor the OC hot spots** of the world to be prepared in case mafia migration is going to happen in the direction of our country.
This is the end

Beautiful friend
This is the end
My only friend, the end
Of our elaborate plans, the end
Of everything that stands, the end
No safety or surprise, the end
I'll never look into your eyes...again
The end

Doors

L’offerta

Una motivazione cruciale per i membri delle Triadi per trasferirsi in Cina e’ stato il tentativo di sfuggire all’arresto ad Hong Kong e Taiwan.

• Operation “Clean Sweep” 1984;
• Operation “Thunderbolt” 1988
Mercati legali:

Botao Lu, presidente della corte suprema della Princia del Guangdong: “People are reluctant to go to court to settle disputes because it is time and money consuming and it is difficult to get the compensation back even if you win the case”.

• Ad esempio, solo il 15% delle sentenze commerciali vengono implementate
• La fiducia nel sistema giudiziario è bassa
• Uno studio del sistema giudiziario (dispute commerciali) cinese di Qing-Yun Jiang descrive la situazione come una “crisi giudiziaria”.

“Ombrelli protettivi” (baohusan):

Frammenti dell’apparato statale proteggono uomini d’affari dalle autorità e dai concorrenti in cambio di pagamenti regolari.
Una agenzia di riscossione debiti

The advertisement on the second floor reads 'Professional debt recovery'
(Photo by Zhejiang).

Un professionista del settore

Photo by Nanfang Website. The man wears a vest with two Chinese characters, which read "Debt collecting".
The cartoon by Yao Wen depicts a debt-collecting company recruiting its staff. The Big Brother asks the applicants, “Have you ever killed someone?” The advertisement on the wall reads “People who ever killed someone, who once were prisoners, and who are bold and aggressive enough would be desirable.”

Professor Jiuhong Yuan of Southeast University of China: “this legislation increases immensely the possibility that such debt-collection companies will collude with mafia groups or develop into mafias”.

Mercati illegali (China):

- Gioco d’azzardo
- Prostituzione
- Droga

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors facilitating mafia transplantation/cases</th>
<th>Bardonecchia</th>
<th>Verona</th>
<th>Budapest</th>
<th>Rome</th>
<th>New York City (1910-1930)</th>
<th>Rosario (1910-1930)</th>
<th>Shenzhen/Guangzhou</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Generalized Migration</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mafiosi migration (willing/unwilling)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
<td>YES (UNW)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPPLY of Mafiosi</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL CONDITIONS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of trust/civic engagement</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of local illegal protectors</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size of Locale</td>
<td>Small</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New and/or Booming Markets *</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEMAND for mafia services</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRANSPLANTATION</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>